



# Cincinnati & Hamilton County Public Library Facility Master Plan

Report Part III | Updated July, 2023  
Implementation Strategy  
[CHPL.org/next-generation](https://chpl.org/next-generation)





## INTRODUCTION: DESIGN PROJECT PHASING AND BUDGET SUMMARY

In 2018, Hamilton County voters approved a 1mil levy, a portion of which will be used to fund deferred maintenance, renovations, and expansions. These funds will be distributed in annual allotments from 2019 – 2028. To ensure that these funds are put to maximum use, the Public Library of Cincinnati and Hamilton County undertook a year-long planning process whose scope included identifying a vision for future services, evaluating facilities, determining community needs through an extensive engagement process, designing a system strategy, and recommending improvement projects. The outcome of this process is the Facility Master Plan (FMP), which is compiled into three parts:

- Part I – Executive Summary and Facility Master Plan
- Part II – Branch and Main Library Recommendation Summaries
- Part III – Implementation Strategy

This document is Part III, which summarizes the implementation strategy for the ten-year design project recommendations. In the following sections are described the funding, budgeting, and implementation strategies. Capital Maintenance Projects and Strategic Investment Project implementation strategies are being developed in parallel by the Library.

The table below shows the proposed 5-Year and 10-Year projects and budget with intended project launch year. Launch year is when the architectural and engineering team is expected to begin design. Land acquisition is one of the more challenging implementation tasks. To provide the maximum amount of time to find suitable sites, and to have funds available to secure them for the Library, a land purchase allowance is provided up front for all relocation projects, regardless of when they are intended to launch. Project budgets are shown in 2020 dollars and fit within the net present value of the anticipated funding stream and the annual allocations.

**10-YEAR PROPOSED DESIGN PROJECTS - PHASING and BUDGETS (in2020\$)**

Funding	Land Purchases	Allowance	Allowance	Status
2020	BA, DP, DT, FO, MD, MN, MT	Allowance	\$ 3,000,000	\$ 3,000,000
Land Purchase Allowance Subtotal			\$ 3,000,000	\$ 3,000,000

  

Launch Year	Library	Strategy Option A	Strategy Option B	Budget - lower	Budget - higher	Status
2019	Price Hill	Major Renovation, Expansion, Accessibility	Relocation w/ New	\$ 7,000,000	\$ 7,600,000	Completed for \$7.3M Opened in April 2021
2019	Walnut Hills	Major Renovation, Expansion, Accessibility		\$ 11,100,000	\$ 12,300,000	Completed for \$12M Opened in Oct 2022
2020	Deer Park	Replacement / Expansion		\$ 3,500,000	\$ 5,900,000	Completed for \$4.1M Opened in Dec 2021
2020-2021	Madisonville	Major Renovation, Accessibility	Relocation with New	\$ 4,600,000	\$ 5,500,000	Completed for \$3.3M Opened in March 2023
2020-2021	Symmes Township	Makeover + Parking expansion		\$ 4,300,000	\$ 4,700,000	In Design
2023-2024	Miami Township	Relocation with New, Expansion		\$ 2,400,000	\$ 2,700,000	Evaluating Site Options
2023-2024	Forest Park	Replacement/Relocation, Expansion, Accessibility		\$ 11,000,000	\$ 12,300,000	Under Construction Under Construction
Branch Design Projects 2019-2023 Subtotal				\$ 43,900,000	\$ 51,000,000	\$19.2M Expected Opening June 2024

  

Launch Year	Main Library	Strategy Option A	Allowance	Allowance	Status
2019-2020	Energy Retrofit	Allowance - South Building Electrical, HVAC, Fire Protection	\$ 6,000,000	\$ 6,000,000	Completed for \$5.5M in 2020
2020-2021	Capital Repairs	Allowance - South Building Skylight, Elevator Replacement	\$ 2,500,000	\$ 2,500,000	Completed for a combined \$6.1M in 2022
2019-2022	Vine St. Plaza, Stairs and Wayfinding and Small Scale Makeover	Allowance – Extensive Reconstruction/Renovation 100,000 sq ft	\$ 16,800,000	\$ 16,800,000	Under Construction \$28.7M Expected Reopening July 2024
Main Library Design Projects Subtotal			\$ 25,300,000	\$ 25,300,000	
5-Year Design Projects Subtotal			\$ 72,200,000	\$ 79,300,000	

  

Launch Year	Library	Strategy Option A	Budget - lower	Budget - higher	Status
2024-2025	Cheviot	Major Renovation, Expansion, Accessibility	\$ 4,400,000	\$ 4,900,000	In Design
2024-2025	West End	Makeover	\$ 900,000	\$ 1,000,000	Under Construction \$2.8M Expected Reopening Sept. 2023
2025-2026	Mt. Healthy	Relocation with New, Accessibility	\$ 2,400,000	\$ 2,700,000	Seeking Opportunities
2025-2026	Elmwood Place	Makeover	\$ 600,000	\$ 700,000	Seeking Opportunities
2027-2028	Delhi Township	Replacement with New, Expansion	\$ 11,200,000	\$ 12,400,000	In Design
Branch Library Design Projects 2024-2028 Subtotal			\$ 19,500,000	\$ 21,700,000	
10-Year Design Projects Subtotal			\$ 91,700,000	\$ 101,000,000	

Note: This list of projects, proposed improvements, and budgets is subject to change. Scope, size, and schedule will be determined by funds collected and matched to project costs. Recommendations will be adjusted based on market conditions, fund availability, critical repairs, and other factors beyond the Library’s control.

The above project phasing and budget will be updated annually. For the current version and more information on capital maintenance projects, strategic investment projects, and project status, check out the Building the Next Generation Library website at: [CHPL.org/next-generation](http://CHPL.org/next-generation)



## FUNDING, ESCALATION, AND NET PRESENT VALUE

In 2018, Hamilton County voters approved a 1 mil levy, a portion of which will be used to fund deferred maintenance, renovation, and expansion projects across the Library system. These funds will be distributed in annual allotments over a 10-year period from 2019-2028, and will enable many branches to meet community needs for the next twenty years. Approximately \$98M is projected to be available within the first five years. A projected total of \$142M to \$157M will be available over the full ten years, conditional on continued funding streams including state and local funding.

In Part I and Part II of the Facility Master Plan (FMP), the 10-year Priority Design Projects were identified. In total, these will tap into \$120M to \$130M of the levy funding. Because of escalation, which is the normal increase in costs over time, the buying power of each annual allotment will be a little less than the year before. Many local, national, and international labor, material, trade, and market factors affect escalation. While escalation has been higher in recent years, some analysts believe there is a possibility of a market correction with a possible year-to-year reduction sometime in the years ahead. Over the decade-long implementation period, a modest average escalation applied to each year is customary. To assist with project budgeting, the net present value (NPV) of the 10-year allotments was estimated, assuming a 3.5% escalation for 2019-2020, 3.25% for years 2020-2022, then a constant 3.0% thereafter. The NPV of funding for design projects over the first five years is over \$81M in 2020 dollars. The 10-year funding NPV is estimated to be approximately \$112M in 2020 dollars, which is conditional on continued Library operational funding streams including state and local funding.

## PROJECT BUDGETING

Design Project budgets were developed by the consultant team, who are familiar with the local and regional construction market and have experience with comparable new construction and renovation projects. Recent Library construction experience was also used to inform the budgeting. Additionally, total project costs were compared to similar projects recently completed by the Dayton Metro Library bond program, which shares a construction market with Cincinnati.

Preliminary project budgets were prepared for the full range of project improvement options identified in the July 2019 Branch Planning Summit, with the exception of Strategic Investments. These budgets used a rough order of magnitude (ROM) with a single \$/square foot methodology for each of four levels of proposed construction intensity: Level 1, Makeover; Level 2, Moderate renovation and/or small addition; Level 3, Extensive renovation and/or larger addition; and Level 4, Replacement and/or relocation. The table below shows hypothetical scenarios for the Delhi Branch Library for all four levels of possible construction.

CONSTRUCTION vs. PROJECT BUDGETS												
CONSTRUCTION	\$100/sf			\$110/sf			\$220/sf			\$430/sf		
	LEVEL 1			LEVEL 2			LEVEL 3			LEVEL 4		
Land Costs	High Range			High Range			High Range			High Range		
DELHI TOWNSHIP												
Building	Units	Unit Cost	Extended	Units	Unit Cost	Extended	Units	Unit Cost	Extended	Units	Unit Cost	Extended
Existing Building - Renovation	15,150 SF	\$100/SF	\$1,515,000	15,150 SF	\$110/SF	\$1,667,000	15,150 SF	\$220/SF	\$3,333,000	-	-	-
New Construction - Addition	-	-	-	3,000 SF	\$330/SF	\$990,000	6,000 SF	\$330/SF	\$1,980,000	-	-	-
New Construction - Replacement/New	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	30,000 SF	\$430/SF	\$12,900,000
FFE, Signage, Technology (7% new)	7%	\$65/SF	\$739,000	8%	\$65/SF	\$983,000	10%	\$65/SF	\$1,374,750	0%	\$65/SF	\$350,000
Demolition Allowance (if applicable)	-	-	\$0	-	-	\$0	-	-	\$0	-	-	\$0
Special Building Allowance (if applicable)	-	-	\$0	-	-	\$0	-	-	\$0	-	-	\$0
Contingency	15%	-	\$336,000	15%	-	\$580,000	15%	-	\$1,030,250	10%	-	\$1,490,000
<b>Subtotal</b>			<b>\$2,590,000</b>			<b>\$4,196,000</b>			<b>\$7,678,000</b>			<b>\$16,390,000</b>
<b>Site</b>												
Site Development	-	\$15,000	\$15,000	-	\$25,000	\$25,000	-	5%	\$274,000	-	10%	\$1,290,000
Special Site Allowance (if applicable)	-	-	\$0	-	-	\$0	-	-	\$0	-	-	\$0
Contingency	10%	-	\$2,000	10%	-	\$4,000	10%	-	\$46,000	10%	-	\$790,000
<b>Subtotal</b>			<b>\$17,000</b>			<b>\$29,000</b>			<b>\$326,000</b>			<b>\$1,810,000</b>
<b>Building + Site Contract Subtotal</b>			<b>\$2,607,000</b>			<b>\$4,219,000</b>			<b>\$8,196,000</b>			<b>\$17,870,000</b>
<b>Project Costs</b>												
Engineering and Design Fees	15%	-	\$391,000	15%	-	\$633,000	15%	-	\$1,229,000	15%	-	\$2,681,000
Construction Mgmt	0%	-	\$0	0%	-	\$0	0%	-	\$0	0%	-	\$0
Fees: Public Art, Moving, Misc	10%	-	\$261,000	10%	-	\$422,000	10%	-	\$818,000	10%	-	\$1,797,000
Misc: Soft Costs/Contingency	2%	-	\$52,000	2%	-	\$84,000	2%	-	\$164,000	2%	-	\$357,000
Special Project Allowance (if applicable)	-	-	\$0	-	-	\$0	-	-	\$0	-	-	\$0
Project Contingency	10%	-	\$66,000	10%	-	\$111,000	10%	-	\$218,000	10%	-	\$485,000
<b>Subtotal</b>			<b>\$770,000</b>			<b>\$1,250,000</b>			<b>\$2,436,000</b>			<b>\$6,310,000</b>
<b>Project Total</b>			<b>to \$3,377,000</b>			<b>to \$5,469,000</b>			<b>to \$10,620,000</b>			<b>to \$23,180,000</b>
			<b>\$223/SF</b>			<b>\$301/SF</b>			<b>\$502/SF</b>			<b>\$773/SF</b>

Early Rough Order of Magnitude budgeting was done for multiple improvement options at each branch location and downtown Main Library.

From this methodology the total magnitude of the Library capital facility need was estimated to require funding in the \$300M to \$350M range, in 2020 dollars.

## PROPOSED PROJECTS AND PRELIMINARY PROJECT SEQUENCING

Because the overall need is significantly greater than the available funding, a prioritization process was outlined that balanced the following considerations:

1. Project Selection Criteria aligned with the Library's Board of Trustees identified project principles including:
  - *Improve equitable access;*
  - *Address accessibility issues;*
  - *Consider age and condition of existing location;*
  - *Maximize opportunities for Next Generation service improvements;*
  - *Consider sustainable operations.*
2. Sequence projects to fit within funding allotments:
  - *Prioritize funding for land acquisitions;*
  - *Phase projects to align with funding availability;*
  - *Distribute geographically;*
  - *Consider area economic needs;*
  - *Develop sequencing for efficient project delivery.*

Input from the Community Advisory Council, the Staff Advisory Team, Library administration, and the Board of Trustees was used to identify the 10-year Priority Design Projects. Once identified, individual project FMP budgets were prepared for the specific proposed improvement options, with the exception of Strategic Investments. The budgets utilized existing and proposed building sizes, existing and proposed site areas, and rules of thumb for parking, hardscape, and landscape areas. These budgets utilize \$/square foot line items for the following project hard and soft costs:

### Building Hard Costs

- Demolition and/or abatement
- Renovation, tenant improvements
- Premiums for historic or specialized construction
- New construction

### Site Hard Costs

- Site utilities allowance
- Site demolition and preparation
- New parking
- New hardscape
- New landscape

### FF&E (Furniture, Fixtures, and Equipment) Costs

- Shelving and casework
- Building and interior signage
- Furniture
- Technology including AV, tel/data, and security
- Public art
- AMH (automated materials handling), smart check-ins, and/or sorters

The above three categories total to a Design Project construction budget and are inclusive of contractor overhead, profit, and project general conditions. Added to the project construction budget is a construction contingency that varies from 5% for tenant improvement/makeover projects, to 10% for new construction, to 15% for renovation projects.

Soft costs are calculated using rules of thumb percentages of the unescalated construction budget for the following line items:

#### Soft Costs

- Design and engineering services, including architecture, civil engineering, landscape architecture, structural engineering, mechanical engineering, plumbing engineering, fire protection design, electrical engineering, lighting design, audio visual, tel/data, security design, acoustical design, interior design, and signage design.
- Testing, permitting, and fees, including existing condition environmental, geotechnical, and hazardous material assessments, construction phase materials testing, permit and utility fees, and other owner costs.
- Construction management services of a third-party owner's representative, or allowance for capital project staff augmentation to assist in managing contracts and owner responsibilities during design, construction, and move-in/post construction phases.
- Moving cost allowance.
- Soft cost contingency for community engagement, or other services that may be needed.

**Quality Energy and Sustainable Design.** Budgets are based on durable, maintainable materials appropriate for intensive public use. Project quality expectations are based on the recent design for the Price Hill Branch as well as the Reading and St. Bernard Branches with actual costs escalated to 2020. Projects are expected to have a high level of energy efficiency and environmental performance and, where appropriate, will be designed to obtain US Green Building Council's LEED certification.

**Project Delivery.** Project budgets are based on a design-bid-build delivery approach, with an expectation that some construction premiums from Construction Manager at Risk (CMAR) delivery, or savings from bundling projects together, or negotiated discounts, will balance out.

**Land Purchases.** A general allowance for land acquisition was planned. This may be supplemented by the proceeds from any land sales for facilities that may be relocated to a new site.

More detailed project budgets may be prepared during the programming and design strategy phase, and detailed cost estimates will be prepared at key milestones during the design phases.



## DESIGN PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

Each project is anticipated to follow a generally similar process, varied by scope and scale of the project. The duration of these phases will vary based on project complexity and funding allocations. The Board of Trustees will approve the project at key milestones.

- 1. Site Acquisition Phase.** For projects with proposed relocations or site expansion, site opportunities will be evaluated according to the criteria outlined below. Where appropriate, community and stakeholder input may be gathered to help inform the site selection process.
- 2. Pre-Design Phase – Programming, Design Strategy, and Pre-Design Project Budget.** During this phase a detailed list of spaces, or building program, will be prepared. In parallel, a basic site and building strategy will be prepared that will confirm the scope of the project, such as how many stories and general extent of site work. Some due-diligence activities will be conducted at this time to confirm feasibility of intended strategies. The FMP-level project budgets will be updated. The pre-design work for each design project will be done in consideration of the other projects in the planning zone, and each project scope may be adjusted up and down in scope. The community input gathered during the FMP process will inform the work of this phase.
- 3. Schematic Design Phase.** During the SD phase the Architect of Record will prepare the architectural design of the site, building interior, and exterior according to detailed zoning and building code requirements combined with functional and aesthetic considerations. Community input will be gathered typically in two stages,



the first to gather feedback on program and site design, the second on progress with the building design. Options during this early stage can be considered economically. Where appropriate, the process to obtain project entitlements may begin and might include submittals or public meetings with the authority having jurisdiction over the project. Engineering narratives will be prepared, and the first cost estimates will be prepared. For projects to be delivered using the Construction Manager at Risk (CMAR) approach, the CMAR will assist the architect on constructability and cost estimating.

4. **Design Development Phase.** During the DD phase, the architecture will be further developed, and the engineering disciplines will begin their design in earnest. Cost estimates will be prepared again. Changes to scope should be limited. Updates on project design and schedule will be available to the public in displays at the facility in question and on the Library's website.
5. **Construction Documents Phase.** During the CD phase the details of the project will be drawn, and specifications prepared. Final entitlements and a building permit will be obtained at the end of this phase. Changes in scope can be costly in time and fee, and limited add or deductive alternates may be considered. Updates on project design and schedule will be available to the public in displays at the facility in question and on the Library's website.
6. **Bidding and Award.** During a design-bid-build delivery approach, the construction documents will be publicly bid. For CMAR projects, trades and packages will be bid and a guaranteed maximum price (GMP) will be negotiated. The Library Board of Trustees will approve the construction contract.
7. **Construction Phase.** For renovation, expansion, or replacement projects, public access to the construction areas will be temporary limited or closed while the builders perform the construction activities. A groundbreaking or other ceremony may be held to mark the beginning of construction. Progress updates will be available on the Library's website.
8. **Move-in/Close out.** During this phase, furniture and equipment will be moved in, and branch library staff will return, shelve the collections, set up the technology, and make the library ready for use.
9. **Opening.** Once everything is in place and ready to go, the branch library will be reopened to the public through a soft opening and/or grand opening.



## SITE SELECTION CRITERIA

The following Site Selection Criteria will assist the Library in the evaluation of potential sites for re-located Library facilities. These criteria apply to sites for purchase, lease, or to those that may be donated, and will ensure that the Library's facilities are located in places that are convenient and accessible to customers, allow efficient operation, and have a strong presence in their communities.

### Fit with Facility Master Plan Strategies

- Number of libraries
  - *No net-new library locations should be proposed.*
  - *Relocations should be paired with ending library service at original location.*
  - *Consider locations that might draw people from areas where other more significant improvements are beyond the 10-year scope.*
- Planning Zone and Proposed Library Type
  - *Whether the site supports FMP recommendation for a Focused, Neighborhood, or Next Generation library type.*
  - *Proposed site should support the Planning Zone strategy, to increase capacity where called for, and/or develop Next Generation service opportunities.*
  - *Individual library branch strategies should be reviewed and updated to reflect other Planning Zone projects as they are implemented.*

### Site Capacity

- Prioritize sites that, after consideration of topography, zoning, easements, or other possible constraints, can accommodate the recommended square footage of building size and necessary parking spaces.
- For ease of customer use and operational efficiency, seek sites that can accommodate the proposed public spaces on a single floor level.
- Look for sites that provide potential space for future expansion or partnership.

### Location

- Determine sites that are compatible with the community's vision for development and/or revitalization, and that provide the opportunity for synergies with this development.
  - *Look for locations where libraries may serve as neighborhood/community focal points.*
  - *The site should be near other community services (i.e. schools, shopping, civic districts).*
  - *Look for locations that might foster appropriate mixed-use, joint-use, or cooperative ventures.*
- Investigate sites that are centrally located to the residents of the service area (or proposed service area) so that a maximum number of customers will have easy and convenient access to the library.
- Prioritize sites that provide easy and safe pedestrian, bicycle, transit, and vehicular access to the site, as well as sites that are easily accessible by the differently-abled community.
- Look for sites that offer aesthetic value to the proposed library building (inspiring setting, views, etc.).

### Partnerships

- Consider sites that offer an opportunity for partnerships with recreation departments, private businesses, or other appropriate parties.
- Ensure that such sites and potential partnering agencies have compatible goals, missions, and requirements as the Library.

### Cost and Availability

- Recognize the importance of affordability of sites and availability within a reasonable amount of time (i.e., within the time frame of a 5- to 10-year build-out of the plan).
- Weigh any costs associated with a site's existing conditions in the cost analysis of site affordability (such as sites with poor soils, needed mitigations, special construction, or other added costs).